3rd ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING, LITERATURE, AND TRANSLATION
International Conference 2014

Unnes in collaboration with AWEJ and RELO

Conference Proceedings

"The Global Trends in English Language Teaching, Literature and Translation"

Editor:
Siti Wachidah, M.A., Ph.D (Jakarta State University)
Bewi Rochsantiningih, M.Ed., Ph.D (Sebelas Maret University)
Dr. Jossy Yulisari, M.Pd (Semarang State University)
Dr. Khalid Obaid Al-Zubaidi (Universiti Teknologi Malaysia)
Dr. Mirjam Amugrahwadi, M.A (Malang State University)

Faculty of Languages & Arts
Semarang State University
Application of Grammar Translation Method (GTM) in Translating Narrative Texts from English into Indonesian Language

Rudi Hartono
rudi_fbsunnes@yahoo.com
Universitas Negeri Semarang

Abstract

The essential problem of this research was rigidness of translation result of narrative text from English into Indonesian language. The main objective of this research was to apply the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) to improve the quality of narrative text translation result from English into Indonesian language that would be more natural and accepted in the target language users. This research used Classroom Action Research Method applied four steps in each cycle: 1) Identifying the problem, 2) Data gathering, 3) Data interpretation, and 4) Action, 5) Observing, and Reflection. Sources of data in this research were translation documents, field notes, interviews and questionnaires. The research data were the translation of narrative texts, questionnaire answers, result of interviews, and observation notes. The data were obtained by using test, interview, questionnaire, and observation. Based on the result of research it was found that application of GTM could improve students’ translation products of narrative texts from English into Indonesian significantly. It can be seen through the progress score 13.43 gained from the preliminary average score 71.21 (Good) to the final average score 84.64 (Very Good). Thus the GTM can improve students’ translation ability and the result of the research is very significant.

Keywords: Grammar Translation Method, translation, narrative text, English, Indonesian language

Introduction

Translating literary texts, including narrative texts, has a noticeable difference when compared to translate non-literary texts. Translating scientific texts is not as complicated as translating literary texts (Purwoko, 2006, p. 19). Literary texts contain unique and distinctive aspects that are hard to translate. Literary texts have different text structures and linguistic characteristics from non-literary texts, so translating these texts has its own difficulties and complexities (Soemarno, 1988, pp. 19-21).

A literary text is the work that contains messages and styles. Messages that contain connotative meaning and style in the form of aesthetic-poetic mechanism is the characteristic of literary text. Literature is itself a series of papers that describe the history of a community, containing artistic and aesthetic values and read as references (McFadden in Meyer, 1997, p. 2).

A translator of literary texts will face a variety of difficulties, such as difficulties associated with meaning, such as lexical meaning, grammatical meaning, the meaning of contextual or situational, meaning textual, and socio-cultural significance. There are meanings that are easily translated (translatable) and not even difficult to be translated (untranslatable). Furthermore, if a translator is already well aware of his role, he will produce a good translation, namely the qualified translation that is easy to understand and looks like a natural translation product and helpful as a source of information (Kovács, 2008, p. 5).
Narrative text as a work of fiction that belongs to the fairy tale type is one genre that is widely read and told. A Fairy tale contains values and cultural contents of a community. This text type is read by a lot of students as a medium of entertainment and teaching materials. In Indonesian context this is supported by the presence of a new curriculum in the education unit from elementary to secondary schools that includes fairy tales or narrative texts as one of the genres that must be learned. English narrative texts from various countries are also sources of reading and teaching materials used as a comparison with the works of fairy tales in Indonesia. For the purposes of English teaching and learning and dissemination of information about cross-cultural understanding, English narrative texts need to be translated into the Indonesian language accurately and naturally based the culture and context.

Therefore, to produce the qualified translation of narrative texts in Indonesian language, since the beginning, English education students are directed to apply the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) in the process of narrative text translation from English to Indonesian language. The application of this method is very much in line with the use of native language (mother tongue) as an effective and natural medium of communication (Larsen-Freeman, 1986, pp. 9-11).

Each translation experts has different versions of the definition of translation. Nida (1969) states that translating is a reproduction with reasonable and closest equivalence to the source language message into the target language, the first and the second relate to the sense associated with style. "Translation consists of reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalence of the source language message, first in terms of meaning and secondly in terms of style." (p. 12)

Larson (1984) adds that "Translation is transferring the meaning of the source language into the receptor language. This is done by going from the form of the first language to the form of a second language by way of semantic structure. It means that this is being transferred and must be held constant. "(p. 3). In this case Larson (1984) gives opinions on the completeness and harmony between language forms and structures of meaning. This is a package that is capable of delivering a form of understanding the meaning of the text contained by the source that should be able to be transferred to the target text with full responsibility.

**Narrative Text**

According to Gerot and Wignell (1995), a narrative text is a discourse that has the purpose of entertaining and fun to share experiences in a variety of ways (p. 56). Further narrative text has the text structure or schematic structure that consists of:

- a. Orientation: sets the scene and introduces the participants (Who, when, where)
- b. Complication: a crisis arises (What was the problem?) (How was the problem resolved? How did the story end?)
- c. Resolution: the crisis is resolved, for better or for worse
- d. Re-orientation: optional stage

Then the text also has lexicogrammatical features or linguistic features which include and focus on specific participant(s), action verbs, linking verbs, verbal verbs, mental verbs, behavioral verbs, past tense, temporal conjunctions, temporal circumstances, and spatial circumstances.

**Translation of Narrative Texts**
Translating narrative texts differs from translating ordinary texts. A narrative text translator must have the linguistic knowledge of the source and target languages and cultural understanding and deep appreciation of literary works. In addition he must have skills in the areas of languages, literature and aesthetics, and social cultures, so that it can be said that if he does not have those factors, he will have difficulties in translating literary works (Suryawinata, 1996, p. 173). Translating narrative texts is not only transferring the message or looking for the equivalent of the source language into the target language, but also translating the ideas and purposes of the author, so that the original message and intention can be transferred to the readers or receivers (Nord, 1997, pp. 80-84). Accordingly, Hu (2000) asserts that "Translation of fiction is much more complicated than the translation of other genres, as it deals not only with bilingual, but also bi-cultural and bi-social transference" (p. 1).

In addition Reiss in Nord (1997) adds that "A literary translation orient itself towards the particular character of the work of art, taking as its guiding principle the author's creative will. Lexis, syntax, style and structure are manipulated in such a way that they bring about in the aesthetic effect of the target language's the which is analogous to the expressive individual characters of the source text "(p. 69).

From the above it is known that literary translation orient itself to the nature of literary works in accordance with the will of the creative writer. Lexis, syntax, style and structure have a role of bridging the aesthetic effects to the target language an analogue of the expressive nature of the individual in the source language. This means that the translation of a literary work must be in accordance with the principles, ideas and purpose of the author of works that tends to introduce literary and aesthetic values as an expression of the character contained in the literature.

**Grammar Translation Method (GTM)**

Related to the translation of foreign literatures, in this case the translation of English narrative texts into Indonesian language, it is assumed that Grammar Translation Method (GTM) is the most effective methods to aid understanding of the source text into the target text with tools of native language (mother tongue) (Larsen-Freeman, 1986, pp. 9-11). Furthermore Brown (1994) mentions the characteristics of Grammar Translation Method as follows:

a. Classes are taught in the mother tongue, with little active use of the target language.
b. Much vocabulary is taught in the form of lists of isolated words.
c. Long elaborate explanations of the intricacies of grammar are given.
d. Grammar provides the rules for putting words together, and instruction often focuses on the form and inflection of words.
e. Reading of difficult classical texts is begun early.
f. Little attention is paid to the content of texts, which are treated as exercises in grammatical analysis.
g. Often the only drills are exercises in translating disconnected sentences from the target language into the mother tongue.
h. Little or no attention is given to pronunciation (p. 53)

In addition, Larsen-Freeman (1986) proposes some principles Grammar Translation Method, in which (pp. 9-11):

1) The main purpose of learning a foreign language is capable of reading literary works.
2) The main purpose for the students is able to translate the text of one language to another. If they are capable, meaning they are successful foreign language learners.
3) The ability to communicate in the target language is not the purpose of learning a foreign language.
4) Key skills developed are reading and writing.
The teacher has an important authority in the classroom and is very important for students to be able to answer questions appropriately.

It is impossible to find equivalent words in exactly the same native language to the target language.

In the teaching-learning process more priority to look for similarities between the source language and the target language.

It is important for students to know the shape of the target language.

Application deductive rules of grammar in the form of explicit pedagogical techniques.

Learn the language contains mental exercises.

Translator-students should be aware of the rules of grammar of the target language.

If possible, students should remember konjungasi verbs and grammar paradigm in its memory.

**Methodology**

The research method used was action research based on Ferrance Models (2000) with the following steps of cycle: Firstly, in identifying the problem, the researcher identified the issues in detail of the students’ translation of narrative text from English into Indonesian. Secondly, after the identification of the translation problems on the students’ translation products, the researcher tried to collect the data obtained from the test of translation. Thirdly, the obtained data were thoroughly integrated and interpreted. Fourthly, because the interpretation of the data showed a negative condition, the researcher conducted the action by applying Grammar Translation Method (GTM). In this stage, the researcher gave the translation practice of narrative texts by applying the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) and conducted a classroom observation to see the conditions and interactions during action performed. Fifthly, the researcher further noticed the results of translation tests. Sixthly, after the researcher gave a set of questionnaires to all translator students, he conducted them as an effort of reflection about the impact of Grammar Translation Method (GTM) application in the translation process of narrative texts from English into Indonesian.

The data used were obtained from the test scores of preliminary and final test, students’ responses from the questionnaires and interviews and field notes from classroom observation results. All data were categorized and analyzed by using contrastive analysis model (James, 1998) and all data were analyzed based on the model in general taxonomy and komponensial (Spradley, 1980).

**Findings**

**Result of the initial observation**

Based on initial observations (O-1) on the teaching of translation without applying the Grammar Translation Method (GMT) it is found the information as follows:
In addition to the initial observations as a measure to determine the main difficulties of the students in the process of translating text from English to Indonesian, researchers also revealed other information about some of the obstacles to the translation of narrative texts. From the initial interview, it is found that the translator students had problems when they translated narrative texts. These problems can be illustrated in the following diagram:

**Figure 2. The condition of translation before the GTM application**

*Result of the preliminary test*

Here are the results of the initial tests were performed to the application of Grammar Translation Method (GTM) in the class of translation. This initial test was given to fourteen students who attended the class of Translation. The students were given the identity ranging from code 1 to code 14 as participants in this study. The initial test was in the form of translation test translating a narrative text from English into Indonesian without using
The test of each participant was given a score of the initial test or preliminary test score. The score here is as an indicator of the initial students’ ability of translating the narrative text from English into Indonesian without using Grammar Translation Method (GTM).

### Table 1. Result of the preliminary test before the GTM application

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Partisipant</th>
<th>Score of the preliminary test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Code 1</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Code 2</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Code 3</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Code 4</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Code 5</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Code 6</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Code 7</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Code 8</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Code 9</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Code 10</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Code 11</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Code 12</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Code 13</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Code 14</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Average score 71.21

**Result of the final observation (O-2)**

Based on the final observation (O-2) done after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM), it was found that, during the teaching translation process and from the products of narrative text translation, the observation result is as follows:

![Figure 3. Teaching translation after GTM application](image-url)
Result of the final test

After the action research was taken by applying the Grammar Translation Method (GTM), the progress of translation was very significant. Many changes in grammar, sentence structure, and meaning were adjusted to the rules, patterns and acceptability in the target language. Here is the result of the final test obtained from the translation test using the Grammar Translation Method (GTM). In this final test the participants translated the same text as well as in the initial tests. The result can be seen in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Final test score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Code 1</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Code 2</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Code 3</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Code 4</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Code 5</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Code 6</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Code 7</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Code 8</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Code 9</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Code 10</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Code 11</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Code 12</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Code 13</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Code 14</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Average score** 84.64

The comparison between the result of preliminary test and final test

Here is table of the progress scores of the translation results before and after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM). In this table it is mapped the fourteen participants with Code 1 to 14 with respective scores in the column initial test scores and final column test scores, while scores that describe the ability of translation progress after the application of Grammar Translation Method contained are in the column of the progress score and the average progress scores of individuals and groups represented in the columns of mean progress scores (average scores progress).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Initial test score</th>
<th>Final test score</th>
<th>Progress score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Code 1</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Code 2</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Code 3</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Code 4</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Code 5</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Code 6</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Code 7</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Code 8</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Code 9</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Code 10</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4. Result of the questionnaire after the GTM application

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>According to Narrative Text me translate English into Indonesian was difficult.</td>
<td>Yes: 1  No: 13 (7.2%) (92.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Translating Narrative Text as a literary work of fiction is more complicated than translating plain text (non-literary).</td>
<td>Yes: 11  No: 3 (78.6%) (21.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Translating literary works, especially Narrative Text, requires knowledge of language, literature,</td>
<td>Yes: 14  No: 0 (100%) (0%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
and culture of the source and target (English and Indonesian).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Grammar Translation Method (GTM) ease the burden on me to translate literary works, especially the Narrative Text translation from English to Indonesian.</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>(85.7%)</th>
<th>(14.3%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>After using the approach of Grammar Translation Method (GTM) in the translation process, the translation I was much better.</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(85.7%)</td>
<td>(14.3%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussions**

This discussion illustrates the results of the study before and after application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM). The discussion covers three important findings that can be known directly as indicators of the research results. The three findings consist of the quality of students’ translation after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) obtained from the results of contrastive analysis of the translation products, percentage of students’ responses to the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) application obtained from the interview (interview), the benefits of Grammar Translation Method (GTM) in teaching translation process obtained from observations and the questionnaire.

**Quality of the students’ translation**

In general, students who performed the translation before the application of Grammar Translation Method (GTM) showed a good category with an average value of 71.21 (Good), but the translation was still stiff, idioms error still occurred. There are some non-standard use of the terms and some spelling mistakes. Furthermore, the translation was still a little awkward, not natural, and not adaptive to the sociocultural target language. Some terms were translated literally. There were some grammatical errors and distortions of meaning.

On the contrary, after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) the students’ translation product improved better and there was a very significant change. It was indicated by the progress scores between the initial test and final test in the ration amount 13.43. It means that the translation after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) has increased up to 84.64 (Very Good). This indicates that the students’ translation after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) got progress towards better products, more natural in the target language and accepted in the target readerships. There is no distortion of meaning, no literal translation, more flexible. There is no mistake in the use of the term. There are one or two grammatical errors or spelling but not too significant.

**The students’ Responses on Grammar Translation Method application**

Based on the results of interviews with the respondents, it was found that there is a difference between translating applied before and after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM). The significant difference is:

A. Prior to application of Grammar Translation Method (GTM)
   1) Equivalent lexical more dominant;
   2) The results are more literal translation;
   3) Grammar used is not standard;
   4) Structure of sentence patterns are more inclined to source language.

B. After application of Grammar Translation Method (GTM)
1) More contextually dominant counterparts;
2) The translation is more prevalent and natural;
3) No rigid grammar;
4) Structure of sentence patterns are not biased toward the target language.

Conclusions

From the results of research and discussion, it can be concluded that based on the results of the initial test and final test after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) the scores increased progressively up to 13.43 in ratio. The result shows a very significant improvement as the impact of the GTM application. The average of the initial test score is 71.21 (Good) and the final test score is 84.64 (Very good).

Based on observations, the teaching of translation before the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) indicated that the lexical meaning was used more dominant, meaning was still distorted with a rigid grammar and the sentence structures used tended to pattern the source language sentence, the translation was still stiff, whereas after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM), there is a very significant improvement, for examples, the translation is more flexible and natural, the words has tended to contextual, the sentence structure follows the pattern of the target language, and the grammar used is standard.

Based on the results of interviews it was known that before the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM), the lexical equivalences were more dominant, the translation results were more literal, using non-standard grammar, and sentence structure patterns were more inclined to the source language, while after the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) it is found that the translation is more contextual and matching to the target culture, more prevalent and natural, not stiff grammatically and sentence structure patterns are appropriate to the target language. So, with the application of the Grammar Translation Method (GTM) it was also found that some changes go better than before and after the action performed.

References


**Biodata**

Rudi Hartono is a Ph.D of Translation Studies. He is an English lecturer of English Language and Education Department, Faculty of Languages and Arts, State University of Semarang, Indonesia. His major subject is Translation Studies. He got bachelor's degree of English Language and Literature from Padjadjaran University Bandung, Master’s degree of English Education from Indonesia University of Education and Doctoral degree in Applied Linguistics: Translation Studies from Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia.